

## *Power, Protest and the Public Schools*

Melissa F. Weiner (2010). *Power, Protest and the Public Schools. Jewish and African American Struggles in New York City*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Review by Alan Singer

My father Mendel was born on the Lower East Side of New York City in 1920. He eventually graduated from Straubenmuller Textile High School in Chelsea in 1939. His brother Abie was born in 1918 and their older sister Kayla in 1916. Their father Zalman arrived in New York in 1909 from Galicia in Poland, now the Ukraine. Their mother Fayga followed him four years later. My father and his siblings spoke Yiddish at home and in the street, first learning English in school. Their mother never learned to speak English. Their father could pray in Hebrew, but he was a garment worker, not a religious scholar. He spoke Yiddish and workplace Polish and English. Zalman was a loyal member of the ILGWU but never an activist. Katie toyed with socialism as a teenager. Abie and Mendel were always street kids. When they misbehaved, which appears to have been frequently, at least for Abie, Kayla would be called to the office because their parents would have nothing to do with school.

My father-in-law Ed Yanowitz's family migrated to the Lower East Side from Rumania. His father was a furrier, the fur workers union was communist, so Ed and his older brother were communists as teens and young men. They also spoke English and Yiddish. Hebrew was something you mumbled prayers in if you prayed, not something you understood or spoke, and certainly not at the core of their identity as Jews. These boys grew up during the Great Depression and cared little about school and even less about Hebrew. I asked my father and he said as a kid he did not know anybody who spoke Hebrew and he never met anyone who did until he married my stepmother in the 1960s. She had a brother who had migrated to Israel after World War II.

I, on the other hand, went to school in the 1960s and I have studied the period as an historian. My elementary school in the Bronx was involved in a one-way busing plan starting in the 1960s and a small number of Black children from Harlem were integrated into the school. In 1963-1964, Reverend Milton Galamison led a citywide campaign for the racial integration of New York City schools. It was not until the late sixties when the collapse of the civil rights movement and White flight to the suburbs made school integration virtually impossible that the major focus of school activists in the Black community was on community control and what we would now call an Afro-centric curriculum.

Maybe my father and I remember things wrong, but I don't think so. Instead, I think *Power, Protest and the Public Schools, Jewish and African American Struggles in New York City* by Melissa Weiner is more a work of imagination than of history. Central to Weiner's thesis is that the struggle of "Jewish parents" in New York City in the 1920s and 1930s to have Hebrew taught in the public schools as a college preparatory language and the struggle of Black parents in the 1950s to include more African American history and culture in the curriculum were fundamentally similar and demonstrate the capacity of grassroots movements to reshape powerful institutions. It is the story of the way she would

have liked things to have been, with parallel struggles fought by two disempowered groups in different eras, not the history of what actually took place.

Part of the problem may be that Weiner, an assistant professor at Quinnipiac University, is a sociologist rather than an historian or a specialist in educational issues. The book is an outgrowth of her doctoral dissertation in the Sociology Department at the University of Minnesota. In it, she manages to mention every current academic cliché about whiteness, privilege, racialization, discourses, counternarratives, and feminist and critical methodologies, but her bibliography does not list one interview with a participant in either of the struggles. While Weiner's goal is to demonstrate similarities in the struggles fought by Blacks and Jews to improve public education in their communities, a more balanced study, and a more useful one, would have explored both similarities and differences.

Weiner acknowledges that the campaign to have Hebrew taught in public schools was led by upper class better established German Jews embarrassed by the city's Yiddish speaking population and did not involve the millions of new Eastern European immigrants (pp. 99-100). It was neither a grassroots nor a parent-based movement. She never discusses communists in either the Jewish or Black communities, despite the fact that in the 1930s the city councilman from Harlem was a Black communist elected by a coalition of left-wing Blacks and Jews. She ignores the major historical and demographic events of the periods so the struggles she presents lack historical context. New York City schools were not vehicles of advancement for Jews in the 1920s and 1930, after all there was a Great Depression. But with U.S. capitalism dominance of the post-World War II world, suburbanization, and the vast expansion of white-collar work, Jews were able to benefit from public education. Meanwhile, as both Ira Katznelson (in *When Affirmative Action Was White: An Untold History of Racial Inequality in Twentieth-Century America*) and Marvin Harris (in *America Now: The Anthropology of a Changing Culture*) have pointed out, Blacks were effectively barred from housing, jobs, and schools, until after the great wave that had benefited the Jews. I think the economic changes taking place explain what happened much better than non-specific theories of Whiteness applied by Weiner.

In addition, Weiner barely mentions the labor movement or Martin Luther King, and I could find no reference in the book or the index to Malcolm X, who was a prominent street preacher and activist in Harlem during the 1950s and 1960s. The Civil Rights movement of the 1950s and 1960s and the Black Nationalist movement of the 1960s and 1970s do not exist in her universe. This is a doctoral dissertation gone wild by an author determined to prove her theses, not a work of considered scholarship or a contribution to the field.

As a side comment, cover review notes were provided by Pedro Noguera of the New York University Steinhardt School. I have a lot of respect for Noguera as an academic and as an activist, and I agree with his comment that "[t]he power of parent organizing as a means to reform schools and make them more responsive to the communities they serve has been underappreciated largely because the history of past efforts has not been well documented." However, Weiner's work does not do much to change this. It is as if Noguera made a generic observation without reading very much of this book.

---

*Alan Singer is Director of Secondary Education Social Studies and Professor of Secondary Education, Hofstra University School of Education, Health and Human Services.*

*REGIONAL LABOR REVIEW*, vol. 13, no. 1 (Fall 2010).

© 2010 Center for the Study of Labor and Democracy, Hofstra University