Mishaina Joseph

A Critical View of NGOs in Developing Nations

A Case Study of Haiti

Hofstra University

Advisor: Dr. Linda Longmire

Committee: Dr. James Wiley and Dr. Carolyn Eisenberg

For departmental honors in Geography

Department of Global Studies and Geography

Spring 2015

Acknowledgments

This paper would never have been possible without the constant push and support from Dr. Linda Longmire, Dr. James Wiley and Dr. Timothy Smith. Dr. Longmire and Dr. Smith thank you for always being so careful about making sure that I had at least a couple of hours in the day to sit and write out a few pages. You were both always there with words of encouragement and advice on how to proceed.

I could always count on Dr. Wiley's long emails, reminding me to work on it a little bit at a time so I didn't get overwhelmed. Thank you for encouraging me to go out and do this research, I've learned so much about myself and about NGOs. I could not have accomplished this without your unwavering belief in me and on my ability to put this paper together.

I also could never have done this without Dr. Eisenberg. Thank you for agreeing to be part of my committee and for the great feedback and advice that you always provide.

Special thanks to my family in Haiti who gave up so many hours of their day to drive me around to find these elusive NGOs and for accompanying me to the various interviews that I had to conduct around the capital. Thank you for providing me with food and shelter and for

encouraging me to continue when I became frustrated with the lack of information I was receiving.

To the students of the 2015 European Odyssey, always ready to shame me when I didn't work on this thesis, thank you for always pushing me to do better and for always making sure I had a quiet place to work if I wanted to.

Lastly, thank you to the ten NGOs and the sixty people who were willing to answer a curious student's questions. This paper would have been impossible without your insights.

Table of Contents

Introduction 5

What are Non Governmental Organizations? 7

Haiti in Context 13

Haiti and NGOs 16

Conclusion 30

Appendix A: NGO Survey Instruments 37

English Version 37

French Version 39

Appendix B: Population Survey Instruments 41

English Version 41

Haitian Creole Version 42

Appendix C: Table of NGOs Surveyed 43

References 44

Introduction

This paper begins with one simple question: are Nongovernmental Organizations (NGOs) effective? Meaning, are they really improving the condition of those they claim to be helping?

There are many components that go into establishing whether an NGO is effective. First they have to have set goals on which they can be evaluated. Then, there needs to be a system of checks and balances to determine whether the money allocated for the project actually reached it, whether the donors were well informed about the project, whether the local population was consulted, whether they are able to give feedback after it is done, and whether there are both short term and long term benefits to the project. As an undergraduate, this type of research would be nearly impossible therefore I decided to measure NGOs effectiveness by getting direct feedback from the communities that they serve.

This subject is extremely important because of the ever-growing numbers of NGOs on the world stage. Because of the prevalence of these organizations it is important to take a moment and ask if they really contribute to alleviate human suffering. Who better to ask that question but to the people they claim to be serving? There has never before been a better time to question the usefulness of NGOs as an increasing amount of Global

South governments seem more than willing to outsource services to these organizations. Therefore, this paper will fill a very important space in literature because of its emphasis on the communities that NGOs serve instead of the NGOs themselves.

I realized that the best way to evaluate NGOs and their efficiency was to perform a case study. I was lucky enough to have been born in Haiti, dubbed the "NGO Republic," and hence not only spoke both French and Haitian Creole but also had a support system already in place in Port-au-Prince. With all of these advantages, it was fairly easy for me to conduct research in Port-au-Prince over the summer of 2014. I created two sets of surveys targeting two very different portions of the population. The first survey targets the NGOs and the second targets the people residing in the communities in which they serve. The first survey was administered to NGOs headquartered in the communes of Delmas, Port-au-Prince and Pétion-Ville, which form the arrondissement of Port-au-Prince in the West department. During my time there, I was able to survey ten NGOs then go to the communities that they assist in and conduct the second survey, which deals with feedback from the community.

The research for this paper was comprised of three different elements. The first is the literature review where my aim is to explain NGOs, TNGOs,

what they represent, the work that they do, and what experts in the field see as their benefits and their drawbacks. The second will be based on the answers acquired from the surveyed NGOs and the third will be from the information gathered from the segment of the population that those NGOs service.

What are Non Governmental Organizations?

For the past three decades, the world has seen a rise in Nongovernmental Organizations (NGOs). The term NGO describes a broad array of organizations that vary from vast multi-national enterprises to community based, grassroots associations.[1] The term can be difficult to define as it is rarely used consistently and is sometimes used to identify conflicting notions. For the sake of clarity and consistency this paper will rely on the World Bank definition of NGOs which describes them as:

> "[Not For Profit] NPOs and community-based organizations (CBOs) that are (i) entirely or largely independent of government; (ii) not operated for profit; and (iii) exist to serve

[1] Streeten, Paul. "Nongovernmental Organizations and Development." Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science vol. 554 (1997): 193-210. Sage Publication. Web 16 Oct. 2014

> humanitarian, social or cultural interests, either of their memberships or of society as a whole.[2]

Since there is an abundance of need throughout the world, many of these NGOs end up working outside of their own borders. Those are called Transnational Nongovernmental Organizations (TNGOs). The majority of NGOs in the global south are actually TNGOs. Although I will be from now on referring to these organizations as NGOs, following the example of most of my literature, it is necessary to keep in mind that none of them are indigenous to the country where they work.

According to Werker and Ahmed, writers of "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations do," we are seeing a growing number of NGOs because of three factors: "a trend towards more outsourcing of government services; new ventures by would-be not-for-profit "entrepreneurs"; and the increasing professionalization of existing NGOs" (pg. 77). This change is also part of a larger trend of governments worldwide contracting out services or not being able to meet certain needs of their population. So many of those NGOs have provided services that seek to

[2] Participation and Civic engagement, Worldbank.org

fill in some of the gaps left by governmental institutions.[3] One of the problems that arise in that new model is that NGOs are providing goods and services to populations that cannot hold them accountable.

NGOs used to rely heavily on national governments for their funding but as they became more important on the world stage, they were able to diversify their funding sources. "Government-registered NGOs have gone from relying on the government for three-fifths of their revenue in 1964 to just one-quarter in 2004."[4] This means that although governments have been relying more heavily on the NGOs, they in turn are becoming more independent; meaning that NGOs have become an influential sector on its own right. The rest of the funding comes from the private sector, with individual donations, not corporations, having the biggest impact.[5]

NGOs are accumulating a great amount of influence on the world stage, especially when it comes to disaster relief. Over the years, individuals, governments and various other organizations prefer to contract

---

[3] Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014. Pg. 81

[4] Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014. Pg. 81-82

[5] Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014. Pg. 78

"trustworthy" Western-based NGOS in an effort to circumvent what they often believe to be corrupt or ineffective governments.[6] This model is both "Western- centric"[7] and ineffective. It is Western-centric because the belief that any government that does not resemble that of the more prosperous nations of the Global North is automatically more ineffective and corrupt is belittling and historically inaccurate as there is rampant and documented corruption and ineffectiveness in those states as well. This belief is ineffective because this means that the funds raised go through foreign nongovernmental institutions that are not accountable to the citizens and are often not in the "neediest" of communities.[8]

There are many areas of weaknesses when discussing NGOs. As mentioned before, they often fail to reach the poorest of the population, they seldom have a democratic process, they often fail to be innovative and creative but prefer to add extension to already tried methods, they don't often focus on self-reliance and long-term sustainability, even though they are better suited for it then other institutions, and although they do not rely

---

[6] Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014. Pg. 81

[7] The belief that cultural, political and economical norms of Europe and North America are superior.

[8] Streeten, Paul. "Nongovernmental Organizations and Development." Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science vol. 554 (1997): 193-210. Sage Publication. Web 16 Oct. 2014

on state funding as heavily as they once did, it still consists of a large portion of their budget.[9] Having national governments fund organizations that serve communities all around the world raises question as to whether the money comes with strings attached. When taken into context that the money comes from Global North countries while NGOs mostly serve Global South countries, it is not surprising that critics often accuse NGOs of promoting the interest of those national governments that fund them.

It is also not in the best interest of a community to rely too heavily on the aid provided by these NGOs. The communities being served need to become self-reliant enough to provide for themselves or to demand that the governmental institutions, which are supposed to be in place to address these issues, do so. It is crucial to do so because NGOs are not established institutions and therefore will one day leave the region that they are serving or run out of funding to continue serving it.[10]

NGOs have the best intentions when they begin but there seems to be a discrepancy between their intentions and what they actually accomplish on

---

[9] Streeten, Paul. "Nongovernmental Organizations and Development." Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science vol. 554 (1997): 193-210. Sage Publication. Web 16 Oct. 2014

[10] Silberberg, Mina. "Balancing Autonomy and Dependence for Community and Nongovernmental Organization." Social Service Review, Vol. 72, No. 1 (March 1998), pp. 47-69. Chicago Journals. Web. 1 Jan. 2015

site. They create great mission statements, manage to secure funds for a cause, sometimes even manage to influence policy and promote awareness.[11] But when it comes to implementing these policies they fall terribly short. They do not manage to connect with the local population and create "context-specific" intervention techniques, despite their best convictions to do so. [12]

NGOs have been bad for state building. They replace state institutions and therefore undermine them. Usually they are meant to work very closely with the host government but some NGOS have even been know to bypass them completely. Proponents of NGOs have pointed that they were forced to step in to fill the gaps left behind by the weakening governments of developing countries. These states and their institutions have been weakened by the Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs) forced upon them by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank. These policies

[11] Balboa, Cristina M. "How Successful Transnational Non-governmental Organizations Set Themselves up for Failure on the Ground." World Development 54 (2013): 273-287. Baruch College School of Public Affairs. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

[12] Balboa, Cristina M. "How Successful Transnational Non-governmental Organizations Set Themselves up for Failure on the Ground." World Development 54 (2013): 273-287. Baruch College School of Public Affairs. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

have forced them to privatize and to cut back on the social services so vital to their people and that has created the gap that NGOs now need to fill. [13]

Haiti in Context

When the slaves in Haiti won not only their liberation but their independence in 1804 they were ostracized and isolated by the rest of the international community. As a former colony they depended overwhelmingly on exports therefore when they were cut off their economy suffered greatly from that isolation. Years later, France decided to recognize them as a free nation in exchange for 150 million Francs for the damages and losses that occurred during the war for independence. The Haitian government agreed and went into debt for the next eighty years to pay back the sum, further damaging their already weak economy. Because of this, the Haitian government was unable to meet the needs of its people and the country became engulfed in a cycle of poverty and of "constant revolutions, military coups, and social, economic, and political instability." [14]

---

[13] Bradshaw, York W., and Schafer, Mark T. "Urbanization and Development: the Emergence of International Nongovernmental Organizations Amid Declining States." Sociological Perspectives 43.1 (Spring 2000): pp. 97-116. University of California Press. Web 4 May 2015

[14] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

By 1915, the United States had invaded Port-au-Prince in an effort to maintain their economic interest in the region. There, they took control of the political and financial institutions of the nation under the pretext of settling the Haitian debt and restoring stability. By1957, the Duvalier era had begun with the blessings of the American government.[15] NGOs started emerging in Haiti in the 70's, under the rule of Jean-Claude "Baby Doc" Duvalier. The Haitian government was unable to feed its population after the younger Duvalier had emptied its coffers and stolen aid money so NGOs stepped in and began to fill that gap. [16]

The situation became worst in the 1980s when Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs)[17] were put in place with the support of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), the Organization of American States (OAS) and the World Bank. These programs did not help the Haitian economy in the long term and denied millions the services that they have come to rely on. Because of this failure, both the people and the

[15] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[16] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[17] SAPs encourage Global South countries that are in debt to privatize as many services provided by the state as possible and to promote competition in the free market, all standard neo-liberal policies.

international community started to mistrust the Haitian government. Often accusing its officials of corruptions and mishandling of funds. Therefore, "the international community began to shift its policy of providing direct aid to the government to outsourcing it to NGOs as a means to combat corruption."[18] Subsequently, the number of NGO's working in the country has increased tremendously whereas there are five hundred NGOs officially registered but as many as 10,000 working in some capacity in Haiti.[19]

NGOs are playing a much larger role on the world stage. They are significant partners of the United Nations and even have increased collaboration with the World Bank and similar institutions.[20] Many scholars, and residents of developing countries, fear that the role of NGOs has shifted to promoting neo-liberal policies in weaker countries at the behest of

[18] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[19] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[20] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

stronger, richer nations and transnational organizations such as the IMF and the World Bank.[21]

Haiti and NGOs

The work that NGOs perform is commonly views as positive by both the organizations and the people who donate to them. Although few doubt that those who establish NGOs or who work for them do so for the best of reasons, sometimes, good intentions are not enough. Although there has been an increase in the number of NGOs, there has been no substantial impact noticed throughout the world. So the question remains: are they effective?

NGOs in Haiti face the same problems that have been previously discussed by scholars from various different fields. The most pressing, and perhaps most disturbing, of those problems is the absence of Haitians in the decision-making process. One example of such misstep is in the days following the 7.0 magnitude earthquake that ravaged Haiti's capitol leaving almost a quarter of a million dead and one million more displaced. The outpouring of aid from the international community was incredible, reaching 13.5 billion dollars but only one percent went through governmental

[21] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

institutions. [22] The money was funneled through the United Nations and various other TNGOs. The international response set up a base in Port-au-Prince, which they called the Logistical Base or LogBase, to discuss the necessary steps to recovery. This base allowed few Haitians in and consisted of zero Haitian NGOs.[23] Kathie Klarreich points out that these internationally based organizations were not made accountable to the Haitian people.

> "On one side are the thousands of aid organizations that came to Haiti with the entire international aid budget in their bank accounts (several billion dollars among them) and built a powerful parallel state accountable to no one but their boards and donors." [24]

Because foreign donors have trusted NGOs instead of the Haitian government to funnel money to the Haitian people, they have undermined and therefore weakened governmental institutions' ability to provide

---

[22] Ramachandran, Vijaya. "Is Haiti Doomed to be the Republic of NGOs?". Hufington Post. Web 22 Apr. 2015

[23] Klarreich, Kathie. "The NGO Republic Of Haiti." Nation 295.21 (2012): 11. MAS Ultra - School Edition. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

[24] Klarreich, Kathie. "The NGO Republic Of Haiti." Nation 295.21 (2012): 11. MAS Ultra - School Edition. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

services.[25] The focus of foreign states and organizations providing aid has always been on "state building" which often is another term for democratization of the state and opening up its markets to the global trade.[26] The aim is to build a state that is strong enough to sustain itself; but they promote this by focusing on western-centric and neoliberal policies, with which they have been successful, but without taking into account the complex history and culture of the states they claim to be helping. So because so few foreign institutions trust the Haitian state they rely on NGOs to carry out their mission. This means that Haitian Institutions see few of the funds that are promised and have a harder time becoming sustainable.

It is crucial to the work of NGO to actively include the community that it wishes to help in the work that it does. One of the essential features of a successful NGO is that any aid has to take into account the people that it aims to help. An example of this is discussed in Mark Schuller's book, *Killing with Kindness*, where he targets two different NGOs who took different approaches to addressing the need of the Haitian people. *Fanm Tet*

---

[25] Zanotti, Laura. "Cacophonies Of Aid, Failed State Building And NGOs In Haiti: Setting The Stage For Disaster, Envisioning The Future." Third World Quarterly 31.5 (2010): 755-771. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

[26]Zanotti, Laura. "Cacophonies Of Aid, Failed State Building And NGOs In Haiti: Setting The Stage For Disaster, Envisioning The Future." Third World Quarterly 31.5 (2010): 755-771. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

Ansanm engaged the community in which it was working in and also managed to still cater to their donors' needs.[27] *Sove Lavi* on the other hand did not engage those they were targeting as much and too often ended up promoting things that were not relevant to their beneficiaries but rather were dictated by American political concerns.[28]

This ties into one of the main criticism of NGOs which is that they are not only often used as instruments to encourage globalization but are central to its promotion around the world. In this case, critics of globalization views it as the process of promoting neo-liberal policies that focus on privatization and promoting the free-market through strategies such as deregulation, lowering taxes on imports and reducing deficit spending. NGOs encourage these policies because they are so ready to fill the service vacuum left behind by national governments and because they seem so eager to fill that void, this accelerates the privatization of the state; a process David Harvey names "privatization by NGO."[29] Schuller sees them as "semielites," meaning that

---

[27] Schuller, Mark. Killing With Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, And NGOs. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2012. EBook Collection (EBSCOhost). Web. 13 Oct. 2014.

[28] Schuller, Mark. Killing With Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, And NGOs. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2012. EBook Collection (EBSCOhost). Web. 13 Oct. 2014.

[29] Harvey, David. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. Print.

they are the middlemen between the globalization policies of the global north and with the common people in the global south. [30] Although these organizations came in with good intentions they have become unaccountable to the Haitian government and more importantly the Haitian people. The author accuses them of taking advantage of the situation and promoting neo-liberal policies that may be beneficial to them and to others in the international community but not to the Haitian people.[31] This is the most relevant to giant international NGOs such as Oxfam, who have been accused of supporting practices that promote privatization. According to Edmonds, "Before the 12 January 2010 earthquake, Haiti had the most privatized social-service sector in the Americas, with over 80 percent of the country's basic services provided by non-governmental organizations."[32] To him this proves that Haiti's growing reliance on NGOs does not bode well for a self-sufficient and self-determined future but rather will fall into the trap that so

---

[30] Schuller, Mark. "Gluing Globalization: NGOs As Intermediaries In Haiti." Polar: Political & Legal Anthropology Review 32.1 (2009): 84-104. Academic Search Complete. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

[31] Edmonds, Kevin. "Beyond Good Intentions: The Structural Limitations of NGOs in Haiti." Critical Sociology 39 (2013): 439. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

[32] Edmonds, Kevin. "Beyond Good Intentions: The Structural Limitations of NGOs in Haiti." Critical Sociology 39 (2013): 439. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

many Latin American countries have fallen into: widespread privatization of social services which leads to the decrease in accessibility.[33]

Another fatal mistake made by NGOs in the months immediately following the earthquake was to categorize Haitians living in temporary tents as Internally Displaced People (IDPs).[34] This meant that they were treated the same way people living in areas of conflict, like Sudan, were treated meaning that they received food, water and supplies directly in the areas where they were assembled.[35] While for IDPs it is important to keep them together in an accessible area, for Haitians living in camps it gave them no incentive to leave and disperse, which should have been the goals. Relief responders had also failed to remove rubble covering massive areas of Port-au-Prince, which made it difficult to return home or to open up shop. [36]This is again, the result of the lack of cooperation and coordination with locals and their institutions. As stated before, the LogBase of the United Nations

---

[33] Edmonds, Kevin. "Beyond Good Intentions: The Structural Limitations of NGOs in Haiti." Critical Sociology 39 (2013): 439. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

[34] Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

[35] Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

[36] Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

seemed like a world thousands of miles away from Port-au-Prince. The meetings were conducted in English, Haitian NGOs were not invited to attend[37], few Haitians could even get into the compound let along attend it and aid workers had such a quick turnover that one aid worker who has operated in Haiti for a number of years exclaimed "How can you continue to function when there isn't a person who's been here for more than three weeks, and the chairman arrived yesterday?"[38]

One of the questions that I asked NGO representatives during my research was the approximate ratio of foreign to local employees that they hired. They were all adamant that the vast majority of their staff was from Haiti. Nevertheless it is still foreign nationals who run the majority of NGOs in Haiti. They may staff the organizations with Haitians but they are not the ones making the important decisions. This becomes a problem because the decision-making process seems independent of the input of those who know the population the best. A young woman whom I interviewed at the project site of NGO 6 expressed her views on the subject:

"Blan sa yo vini nan peyi nou e pui pa gen an ken moun ki responsab pou yo."

---

[37] "Haitian NGOs seek reconstruction Role." America 202.11 (2010): 10

[38] Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

"These are strangers coming to our country who answer to no one and are basically given a blank check."

Instead of working with Haitians to come up with the best solution on how to provide the most effective help, the whole process becomes eerily reminiscent of the "savior complex" where foreign nationals get to decide what the local population needs and what's better for them. This whole exercise also makes it ineffective because they cannot truly help without involving Haitians of every socio-economic background in every step of the decision-making process.

It is rare that NGOs are in the communities that need them most. When asked whether they believed that they worked with the communities that had then most dire need, every NGO surveyed was very adamant that they did. But what I noticed from the random ten that I surveyed was that although they were serving communities that could use some support, they were not necessarily in the most devastated areas. In Haiti, the biggest slum in Port-au-Prince is named *Cité Soleil* and there are few NGOs working there. However it is important to note that although areas like *Cité Soleil* are in need of the most aid, they are also the most dangerous. I interviewed an aid worker who talked to me about her experience entering *Cité Soleil* to install a water pump with her organization. Although she herself was

Haitian, the people of the area recognized her as an outsider and began making threats. The aid worker and her team retreated and reassessed the situation. They talked to the local police who told them that very few police officers were willing to go in *Cité Soleil* but that he might have a solution. An officer friendly with the leaders of the gangs populating the slum was able to get the group a pass to build the pump after the leaders were convinced that they were just humanitarian aid worker who wanted to help the local community. This demonstrates the intricacies in providing aid but also emphasized the need to be in close contact with those who actually know the community.

Like I stated in the introduction, one way to measure effectiveness is to verify if the goals that the organization set up for itself have been accomplished and whether they are successful in both the long and short term. What I discovered during the course of my interviews is that the various NGOs did have very concrete and straightforward plans. They knew what they wanted to accomplish but there always seemed to be a discrepancy between what they wanted to achieve and what they actually did. When interviewed, the people in the communities in which they served were not thrilled about the job that NGOs have been doing. A father of three had this to say:

"*Oganization sa yo we tet yo selmen. Yo pa gade kisa moun peyi an beswen. Si yo te vle range peyi an vre, yo ta range'l deja*"

"These organizations only see themselves. They do not see the need of the people. If they did want to fix the nation, they would have already done it."

One of the criticisms that came across most often was the belief that NGOs were mishandling funds. Although probably none of those interviewed would be able to actually prove that statement, one just needs to look around to see that it is true. Billions of dollars were donated to the island after the January 2010 earthquake yet four years later there are still thousands living in temporary housing, there are hundreds of half-built (or half destroyed) buildings around the capital and the people of Port-au-Prince are still poorer than ever. It is therefore understandable that Haitians are frustrated with both the work of their government and that of NGOs.

Another way to incorporate the local population is to make them feel heard by providing a way for them to assess the work that NGOs are doing. Only two of the ten NGOs surveyed had a system in place. These communities have very real grievances with the organizations serving them but no way to express them. One old woman told me:

"Yo trete nou tankou chien le yap ba nou mange. Se kom si nou pat pedi ase."

"They treat us like animals when we go to collect the food. As if we hadn't lost enough."

In a way, I think that it is for this reason that so many were willing to be interviewed. It seemed that I was the only one asking them how they felt about these organizations that had almost become their de facto institutions. They complained about the way they are treated when they go to these NGOs: stories of waiting in line for hours under the hot sun only to be served rotten and leftover food or services being arbitrarily refused or preference being given on no foreseeable basis. There needs to be a way for these organizations to be held accountable to people other than their donors because what is the point of wanted to serve a community is it resents your presence?

It is crucial to keep in mind that there are still some NGOs in Haiti that have managed to do great work. Organizations like Partners in Health, that are accountable to the local community, promote sustainable development and relief, focus on accessibility to services like healthcare and education and also manage to have diverse forms of funding are what the

norm for NGOs should be.[39] They build local hospitals and although they have plenty of volunteers from the United States, they also focus on training and educating the local population. They do so by investing in medical schools and funding machines and materials that would benefit the local hospitals and the local medical schools. They rarely promote a political agenda that is not that of the local community as they often survey and ask for feedback from their patients and they also work well with the local government by establishing schools and resources that guarantee the long-term sustainability of their projects.

It is also worth mentioning that the role of many organizations changes in the months following the earthquake since they had to focus on immediate relief efforts before they could focus on long-term development. Many NGOs were thrown into areas that they had no experience in and were forced to adapt. The shift that had to happen from long-term aid to disaster relief to the refocus on long-term aid was not an easy and smooth one. For the case study I was able to ask the segments of the population that they were serving whether they saw a change in the way that service was provided during that time. Most had positive things to say about the weeks

[39] Zanotti, Laura. "Cacophonies Of Aid, Failed State Building And NGOs In Haiti: Setting The Stage For Disaster, Envisioning The Future." Third World Quarterly 31.5 (2010): 755-771. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

following the earthquake. It seemed that NGOs were good at immediate disaster relief, being able to rally and work together to provide the three basic necessities: food, water and shelter. It was when the situation calmed that they began to struggle. Not only did these organizations have to focus on long-term development once again but they had to do so in a condition that was worst than what they had to deal with before and therefore had to start from scratch.

The biggest discrepancy that I have found is between what NGOs think they're doing and what Haitians think they're doing. As mentioned before, Haitians believe that these organizations receive more money than they actually spend. Some might wonder what it matters how the locals see the NGOs as long as they do a good job. However it doesn't seem that there is much accountability, especially in Haiti. When asked how they evaluate their effectiveness, most NGOs describe a very arbitrary system, which doesn't involve the people they are actually serving. They get to assess themselves on whether they've done a good job.

NGOs need to be held more accountable for the services that they provide as this sector, like any other, also has its fair share of corruption. As the sector takes on a bigger role and therefore increases in power and responsibility, some NGOs tend to contract out some of their departments.

As an example large international NGOs are known for having separate headquarters for their fundraising and their services. Larger NGOs are also known to outsource to smaller, local, NGOs. This is great because local NGOs are more likely to know the local population and their needs better but this can also lead to corruption as the money passes from the donors, to the large NGOs and then to the smaller one. There are plenty of opportunities for things to go wrong and for the money to diminish as it gets into the wrong hands.

During my interviews I also came across a number of individuals who believed that NGOs were great, not because of the services that they give out, but because they supplied jobs to the local population; which means that some Haitians view NGOs as job creators. Meaning that they allow for a new job market in service related industries for the local population. Although I doubt that the employing capacity of NGOs is very significant, it is important enough for some individuals to be furious at the fact that more and more NGOs are closing up shop. This means that NGOs could also have an impact on the local economy, especially in a country like Haiti, which has thousands of NGOs.

Conclusion

It is safe to say that Haiti has become overly dependent on foreign aid. Half of the budget of the Haitian government relies on foreign aid[40] and remittances account for more than a quarter of its economy.[41] The Earthquake that took place on January of 2010 exacerbated the country's already weakened state, bringing about billions of dollars of foreign aid channeled not through the national government but through international organizations.

NGOs are trusted institutions, believed to have a significant impact on the lives of those they claim to be serving. But lately, there has been a push to ask one simple question: are they really helping? NGOs have been accused by the people of the Global South of promoting neoliberal ideologies through their projects. It shows that they are not always good, even when they have the best intentions. The focus on the social impact that globalization, and more specifically NGOs as its intermediary, has on the local Haitian population is very critical to this paper as it directly relates to the effect of NGOs on those they serve. It provides an anthropological look

---

[40] From Relief to Development: Moving Forward in Haiti. CARE.org, 20-22 Aug. 2012. Web. 10 Oct. 2014.
[41] Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

at the idea of globalization by focusing on the impact that it has on social norms instead of just economical benefit. It would be of interest to see if being an "NGO Republic" has altered the fabric of Haitian society. [42]

NGOs are facing many pressing issues. Their primary issue is their focus on the "donor-knows-best" model, meaning that they take into account the wishes of the donors rather than the need of the communities that they are serving. Like any other growing institutions, they have also run across corruption; which often occurs when large organizations contract out some of their department or projects. Another important setback with NGOs is that they are not often in the neediest of communities and therefore not serving the neediest people but they are providing a necessary service and therefore should be reformed rather than taken out of the equation altogether. The best way to have effective and sustainable development is to cater services and models directly to the people that are being served. They could give vouchers to the beneficiaries so they can choose the services that they spend it on. [43]

---

[42] Schuller, Mark. "Gluing Globalization: NGOs As Intermediaries In Haiti." Polar: Political & Legal Anthropology Review 32.1 (2009): 84-104. Academic Search Complete. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[43] Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

In Haiti, it might be suitable for NGOs to focus on the *Lakou system*; which is a

> "Living arrangement created by former slaves after the Haitian Revolution which led to an independent Haiti in 1804. The arrangement usually involves a group of five to seven closely-knit families with different last names, who build homes and/or grow crops on a shared plot of land. Normally, the families whose last names were the original beneficiaries own the land."[44]

This system is being left behind an in order to "modernize" Haiti but these efforts are thinly veiled neoliberal policies. These policies promote western-centric, market based solutions to all problems while leaving behind centuries of ingrained practices which focus on the survival of the community instead of the capital gain of the few. Instead of wiping them out, it would be beneficiary to NGOs to use this system because it is an established one based on mutual sustainability and development. By utilizing the sense of community that is already present in each of the *Lakou*, NGOs could cater directly to the needs of the community by encouraging the

[44] Merilus, Jean-Yves. "Rural Development: The Economic Potentials of Haiti's "Lakou" system." Focus on Geography 58.1 (January 2015):36-45. American Geographical society of New York. Web 13 Apr. 2015.

development of community gardens and farms and anything else that the community might need such as education and healthcare.

NGOs are necessary. They perform activities that many governments are unwilling or unable to and therefore service communities. It is also very important to remember that the international community often bypasses Global South institutions and organizations in favor of foreign, or transnational, ones. This has severely exacerbated the national government's stability and sustainability and hurt the Haitian people in the long run. [45]

> "Instead of being mere extensions of the nation-state, NGOs tend to perceive themselves as separate from it and according to Matthews (1997) are competing with it for constituencies… national governments are losing not only autonomy in the global economy but also their ability to implement national policies due to the increasing capacity of NGOs through the development of modern communication to build constituencies of their own and establish direct connections to people around the world."[46]

---

[45] Klarreich, Kathie. "The NGO Republic Of Haiti." Nation 295.21 (2012): 11. MAS Ultra - School Edition. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.
[46] Pierre-Louis, Francois. "Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti." Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

Because of this, NGOs are often accused of promoting neo-liberal policies as they facilitate the privatization of services by introducing themselves as a viable option aside from the governments. Meaning that, international organizations such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank can suggest denationalizing services because NGOs would be able to provide these services. Sustainability is the key to a successful Haiti. The best way to do so would be to invest directly into the government instead of NGOs because the government is the stable representative of the people and is therefore more likely to invest the money back into the community while NGOs, no matter their intentions, are not permanent institutions and tend to invest their money in goods, people and services from abroad.

Critics of this model have rightly pointed out the level of corruption in the Haitian government and that is an issue that needs to be dealt with for effective development. One of the best examples of this is the unsuccessful *Unité de Coordination des Activités des Organisations Non gouvernemental (UCAONG)*[47] a subset of the *Ministere de la Planification et de la Cooperation Externe (MPCE),*[48]responsible for monitoring NGO activities in Haiti. The UCAONG is so incompetent that when asked for a complete list of NGOs present on the island, not only did they provide me with a list

[47] Coordination Committee of Nongovernmental Organizations Activities
[48] Ministry of External Pacification and cooperation.

only a few ours later but it also was severely outdated. Many of the organizations had either moved or left the country completely. For some the phone numbers were disconnected and even some names had change. How could this committee keep track of NGOs if they could not even find them? I asked NGOs 1, 4 and 6 whether they worked with one another since they all focused on water and they all responded that they used to. The UCAONG use to hold an annual mandatory event that would bring together representatives from every NGO in the country to encourage them to work together. It's been four year since the last meeting and none seem to be in site for this year. One of the first steps to reforming the conduct of NGOs in Haiti would be to make sure that this committee is able to act as the checks and balances of that sector and be able to implement policies, which are in the best interest of the Haitian people and government. Although these critiques are well founded it is important to keep in mind that the government is not the only sector prone to corruption.

Nongovernmental Organization emerged from a place of good. They multiplied so quickly in an effort to meet the needs of the million of people suffering all around the world. Although they were formed with good intentions, it does not mean that they actually do good. NGOs have created a system of dependency for both Global South governments and their citizens.

Though NGOs may not be effective in their current state, they can, and should, be reformed in an effort to make a more efficient way to solve the world's problems.

Appendix A: NGO Survey Instruments

English Version

1. What is the mission of your NGO?
2. What services do you provide in the area?
3. What factors entered into your choice of this area?
4. How does this community compare with others in Haiti with regard to its need for services and assistance?
5. What is your ratio of local to foreign employees?
6. Is the local population able to provide input into the decision-making process you use in planning the services you provided?
7. What kind of feedback about you work here, if any, have you received from the local population?
8. Do you have an exit strategy? That is, are you working towards the goal that one day the local population will no longer need you to provide the services you offer here?
9. Do you interact with the local government? If so, in what ways?
10. Does your organization have any evaluation process that allows it to determine whether or not it is succeeding in fulfilling its mission? If so, do local people have the opportunity to participate in that process?

11. Does your organization have a way for donors to check what projects their donations are going to and if those projects are accomplished?
12. When did your organization begin its work in Haiti? And in this specific area?
13. Has the nature of your organization's work here changed since the 2010 Earthquake?
14. Does your organization work collaboratively with other NGOs or the U.N?

French Version

1. Quelle est la mission de votre ONG ?
2. Sur quel projet travaillez-vous dans cette section?
3. Quel sont lest facteurs entrer dans votre décision de choisir cette section ?
4. Comment est ce que cette communauté compare avec d'autres concernant le besoin de vos services ?
5. Quel est votre rapport d'employer local a étranger ?
6. Est la population locale en mesure de contribue dans le processus de prise de décision que vous utilisez quand vous planifiez vos services ?
7. Quel type de commentaire recevez-vous de la population locale ?
8. Avez vous une stratégie de sortie ? Travaillez vous pour qu'un jour la population sera capable de prendre soins d'elle même ?
9. Avez vous une relation avec le gouvernement ?
10. Avez vous dans votre organisation un procès d'évaluation pour déterminer si vous étiez en trains d'accomplir votre mission ?
11. Avez vous un moyen ou les bailleur de fond peuvent vérifier sur leurs dons ?
12. Quand avez vous commence a travailler en Haïti ? and dans cette section spécifiquement ?

13. Es ce que la nature de votre organisation a changé après le tremblement de terre ?
14. Travaillez vous avec d'autre ONG ou avec les Nations Unis ?

Appendix B: Population Survey Instruments

English Version

1. Do you know what an NGO is?
2. Do you know of these NGO's in your area? (Have a list of NGOs ready)
3. Did you know there were so many NGOs in your area?
4. Have you or anyone you know ever received goods or services from these NGOs?
5. If so, how would you describe the goods or services provided by the NGO?
6. Would you like to see any changes made in the work that NGOs do in your community?
7. Has an NGO ever asked how satisfied you were with the services or goods it was providing?
8. What do you think should be the goal of an NGO working in your community?
9. Should the NGO have helping the community achieve self-sufficiency as a major priority?

Haitian Creole Version

1. Eské ou konen kisa on ONG yé ?
2. Eské ou te konen ONG sa yo té nan zone ou an ?
3. Poukisa ou pansé gen tout ONG sa yo ?
4. Eské ou mem ou bien on moun ou konen jam resevwa service nan yon ONG ?
5. Kijan service lan te ye ?
6. Eské ou ta renmem wè changemen nan fason ONG yo travay nan komunoté an ?
7. Eské on ONG janm mandéw si ou té satisfè avek sèvis li ba ou an ?
8. Kisa on pansé bu ONG yo ta suposé yé ? Kisa ou ta vlé yo fè pou komunoté an ?
9. Eské yo te suposé travay on jan pou on jou moun yo ka pran swen tèt yo ou bien govènmen ka pran swen yo ?

Appendix C: Table of NGOs Surveyed

NGO	Areas of Intervention	Number of people interviewed on site
NGO 1	Water sanitation and access	8
NGO 2	Distribution of basic provisions	6
NGO 3	Distribution of basic provisions	5
NGO 4	Water sanitation and access	6
NGO 5	Healthcare for expectant mothers	6
NGO 6	Water sanitation and Access	7
NGO 7	General healthcare	5
NGO 8	Education of women and girls	5
NGO 9	Community development	6
NGO 10	Education	6

References

Balboa, Cristina M. “How Successful Transnational Non-governmental Organizations Set Themselves up for Failure on the Ground.” World Development 54 (2013): 273-287. Baruch College School of Public Affairs. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

Edmonds, Kevin. “Beyond Good Intentions: The Structural Limitations of NGOs in Haiti.” Critical Sociology 39 (2013): 439. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014

From Relief to Development: Moving Forward in Haiti. CARE.org, 20-22 Aug. 2012. Web. 10 Oct. 2014.

Harvey, David. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. Print.

Katz, Jonathan M. The Big Truck that Went by: How the World Came to Save Haiti and Left Behind a Disaster. New York, N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

Klarreich, Kathie. "The NGO Republic Of Haiti." Nation 295.21 (2012): 11. MAS Ultra - School Edition. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

Merilus, Jean-Yves. “Rural Development: The Economic Potentials of Haiti’s “Lakou” system.” Focus on Geography 58.1 (January 2015):36-45. American Geographical society of New York. Web 13 Apr. 2015

Middleton, Jacob. "Friends of the Poor or of Neo-Liberalism?" Socialist Review. The Socialist Review, Oct. 2006. Web. 1 Apr. 2015.

Pierre-Louis, Francois. “Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti.” Journal of Black Studies 42 (2011): 186. Sage Publication. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

Silberberg, Mina. “Balancing Autonomy and Dependence for Community and Nongovernmental Organization.” Social Service Review, Vol. 72, No. 1 (March 1998), pp. 47-69. Chicago Journals. Web. 1 Jan. 2015

Streeten, Paul. “Nongovernmental Organizations and Development.” Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science vol. 554 (1997): 193-210. Sage Publication. Web 16 Oct. 2014

Schuller, Mark. "Gluing Globalization: NGOs As Intermediaries In Haiti." Polar: Political & Legal Anthropology Review 32.1 (2009): 84-104. Academic Search Complete. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

Schuller, Mark. Killing With Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, And NGOs. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2012. EBook Collection (EBSCOhost). Web. 13 Oct. 2014.

Werker, Eric, and Faisal Z Ahmed. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" Journal Of Economic Perspectives 22.2 (2008): 73-92. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014.

Zanotti, Laura. "Cacophonies Of Aid, Failed State Building And NGOs In Haiti: Setting The Stage For Disaster, Envisioning The Future." Third World Quarterly 31.5 (2010): 755-771. Business Source Premier. Web. 16 Oct. 2014